

# Building Multilevel Governance from the Ground Up:

## Securing Intergovernmental Support for Municipal Policy Goals

Martin Horak

Presentation to 73<sup>rd</sup> annual conference of the Federation of  
Canadian Municipalities  
Toronto, May 28, 2010

## Question:

How can municipal leaders secure multilevel support for local policy goals?

## Evidence base:

Studies of multilevel governance in 12 cities:

Calgary, Charlottetown, Halifax, Moncton, Montreal, Ottawa-Gatineau, Saint John, Saskatoon, St. John's, Toronto, Vancouver, Winnipeg

- Full studies will appear in Robert Young and Martin Horak, eds., *Sites of Governance: Multilevel Governance and Public Policy in Canada's Big Cities*

# Securing Multilevel Support for Local Policy Goals

- Municipalities require multilevel support to address complex, costly policy problems
- Securing support often necessitates proactive effort by municipal officials
- Such efforts do not always succeed

# Multilevel TTC Funding: A Success Story



## TTC Funding: Case History

**The problem:** Withdrawal of provincial funding for TTC in late 1990s; fiscal crisis.

**The response (1):** Build big-city lobbying alliance focused on federal government.

**The response (2):** Focus all Toronto intergovernmental infrastructure funding demands on TTC capital needs. Maintain consistent political attention to the issue; take advantage of political change at other levels.

**The result:** Almost \$500 million in annual intergovernmental assistance for the TTC.

## Intergovernmental funding for TTC, 2000-2007 (\$ million)

	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007
Provincial	0	0	63	141	141	159	271	329
Federal	0	0	62	14	12	163	166	112
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>125</b>	<b>155</b>	<b>153</b>	<b>322</b>	<b>437</b>	<b>441</b>

**Note:** All of the federal funding listed is for capital purposes. Provincial figures include operating subsidies, which started at \$70 million in 2003 and increased to about \$90 million in 2005 and thereafter.

**Source:** Toronto Transit Commission Annual Reports 2002-2008.

# Securing Multilevel Support: Factors Beyond Control of Municipal Officials

1. Electoral or economic significance of a city at other levels of government.
2. Overall ideological or policy orientation of provincial or federal government.
3. Intergovernmental distribution of authority in the policy field.

# Securing Multilevel Support: Five Insights for Municipal Officials

1. Ensure that administration is internally united.
2. Build alliances with other actors.
3. Offer sustained political leadership.
4. Anticipate and seize windows of policy opportunity at other levels of government.
5. Be prepared to formalize sharing of authority with other levels of government.

# The federal Conservatives and multilevel governance (revisited)

- “Open federalism”: a difficult context for multilevel governance
- Yet pre-existing formalized multilevel supports remain in place
- Toronto examples
- Implication: “lock in” gains when multilevel conditions are favorable